Direct Support Professional Workforce
Lutheran Services in America Disability Network
Carefree Resort and Conference Center
February 4, 2016

Amy Hewitt, PhD
Research and Training Center on Community Living
Institute on Community Integration
University of Minnesota
Objectives

• Share and compare current practices regarding DSP recruitment, retention and training
• Discuss implementation challenges and successes using tools and resources
• Benchmarking within LSS and next steps
Changing LTSS landscape
Research and Training Center on Community Living: University of Minnesota

Policy

Individuals + Families/Allies + Practitioners/Providers = Quality and Scale

Research

Professional Education & Training

Technical Assistance

Practice
Community living and participation

- A complex and evolving construct related to individual preferences, contexts and cultural and linguistics lenses
  - where and with whom a person lives;
  - if and where a person works;
  - the financial resources available to the individual;
  - what a person does during the day;
  - their quality of relationships with others, including love;
  - what and with whom a person does things of personal interest,
  - an individual’s health (physical and emotional);
  - if, where and with whom they meet their spiritual needs;
  - their interest and opportunity to engage in learning and personal growth throughout their lives;
  - their opportunities and ability to make informed decisions about and determine the direction of their own life, and
  - their human right to assume roles and responsibilities as a citizen (e.g. neighbor, taxpayer, voter).
Context is Everything

Common policy drivers

- **Litigation**
  - Olmstead v L.C.

- **Legislation**
  - Americans With Disabilities Act
  - Rehabilitation Act
  - DD Act
  - Affordable Care Act
  - Autism Cares
  - Every Student Succeeds Act

- **Budget**

- **Policy Initiatives**
  - Money Follows the Person
  - New Balancing Incentives Program
  - Community Living Initiative
  - State Olmstead Plans
  - HCBS community settings rule
    - Transition plans
    - Assessments
Children and adults in state IDD facilities 1950-2013

Source: RISP - Larson et al, 2015
Where did people with IDD live in 2013? (setting type)

- 6,154,636 (est.) people in the US have IDD
- 1,297,378 in IDD services (26%)
- 1,134,325 residence type known
  - 11% own home
  - 28% congregate
  - 6% host/foster
  - 56% w/family

US on caseload vs. US not on caseload

- Family/Host Family/Foster Care: 53% vs. 85%
- Own Home/Spouse: 10% vs. 15%
- Group Setting: 24% vs. All Others

University of Minnesota
% not in family homes with 3 or fewer people (setting size)

FY 2013
Medicaid LTSS recipients with IDD by age (funding authority)

United States

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Number</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Waiver (Family Home)</td>
<td>127,051</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waiver (Non-Family)</td>
<td>175,563</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICF/IID</td>
<td>75,045</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For the US, 35 states reported Waiver data for age 21 and younger, 36 states reported Waiver data for age 22 and older. FY 2013
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Setting</th>
<th>Per Person Medicaid Expenditure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Waiver (Family Home)</td>
<td>$14,950</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waiver (Non-Family)</td>
<td>$44,775</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICF/IID</td>
<td>$130,780</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For US, 51 states reported Waiver data, ICF data is preliminary. FY 2013
U.S. Employment and day supports
IDD agencies

Data: Number in integrated employment services
Source: ICI National Survey of State IDD Agencies

University of Minnesota
Who Decides Where Autistic Adults Live?

For many intellectually and developmentally disabled people, large campuses or farmsteads may be better options than small group homes. But new state laws could make it hard for big facilities to survive.

Link to article:
A matter of dignity

- Dead end jobs, low pay
- Alone and at risk
- Families wait years
- Inclusion pays off
- Intimacy denied

FAILING THE DISABLED
How Minnesota isolates and marginalizes thousands of adults with disabilities

http://www.startribune.com/a-matter-of-dignity-a-five-day-special-report/339820912/
DSP Workforce.

Workforce Key to Quality
High expectation discrepancy

- Specialized knowledge
- Comply with rules and regulations
- Teach
- Document
- Support choice
- Culturally competent
- Respect rights
- Problem-solve
- Medical support
- End shift neat & tidy
- Maintain health & safety
- Person-centered
- Work well with others
Isolated and alone
What We Know About the DSP Workforce in the United States
Direct support workforce U.S. data sources

- Nothing national specific to sector
- Bureau of Labor Statistics
  - Occupational titles
- Emerging national picture with National Core Indicators – workforce stability survey
- Haphazard state studies
- Every so often trade association data
- One time only six state lens cross sector
NCI staff stability survey

• Number of DSPs employed/separated in past year
  • Length of tenure
• Wages
  • Starting average hourly and current average hourly
• Benefits
  • Health insurance, dental insurance, PTO, etc.
• Recruitment and Retention
  • Incentives, RJPs, etc.
Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services (CMS) minimum data set

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Workforce Volume</th>
<th>Workforce Stability</th>
<th>Workforce Compensation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of FT</td>
<td>Turnover rate</td>
<td>Average hourly wage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of PT</td>
<td>Vacancy rate</td>
<td>Benefits (PTO, health insurance)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
United States: Size of Direct-Care Workforce, 2014

Total: 4,283,820

- Independent providers: 800,000
- Personal care aides: 1,257,000
- Nursing assistants: 1,427,740
- Home health aides: 799,080

Source: PHInational.org
Five Million Direct-Care Workers Needed by 2020

- Registered Nurses: 3.4 m
- Fast Food and Counter Workers: 3.6 m
- Law Enforcement/Public Safety: 3.7 m
- Teachers from K-12: 3.9 m
- Direct-Care Workers: 5.0 m

© 2012, PHI

www.PHInational.org

- Personal care aides: 49%
- Home health aides: 48%
- Nursing assistants: 21%
- All occupations: 11%

Source: PHInational.org
United States: Direct-Care Worker Households Relying on Means-Tested Public Assistance, 2013

- Any Public Assistance: 49%
- Medicaid: 39%
- Food and Nutrition: 33%

Source: PHInational.org
United States: Median Hourly Wages for Direct-Care Workers, 2014

- Personal care aides: $9.83
- Home health aides: $10.28
- Nursing assistants: $12.07
- All occupations: $17.09

Source: PHInational.org
Median Hourly Wages for Direct-Care Workers, adjusted for inflation (2011 dollars)

- Personal Care Aides: $10.22 in 2001, $9.49 in 2011
A supply and demand problem

- Increasing demand for long-term supports and services, especially in home and community-based settings
- Supply of workers not growing fast enough to keep up with demand
- Low wages, limited benefits, limited training opportunities
- Persistently high turnover and low retention
- Quality of services depends on the quality and stability of the workforce
Pervasive, costly and sustained U.S. DSP workforce challenges

• High Turnover (40-50%)
  • Many leave early within first 3-6 months
  • Vacancy rates hover around 20%
  • Overtime costs are high
  • Annual costs for replacing one DSP is estimated at $4,872 (ANCOR 2010)

• Low wages
  • “roughly” $10.00-$11.00/hr

• Poor access to and utilization of benefits
• Limited access to adequate training and education
• Increasingly absent or ineffective supervision
• Status and Image
Importance of DATA

- Legislative advocacy
- Accuracy in separating information DSP who with certain populations or types of services
- Make informed policy and practice decisions
- Create wage scales within organizations
- Other reasons?........
How Many of You Completed This Survey?

LUTHERAN SERVICES IN AMERICA DISABILITY NETWORK WORKFORCE SURVEY 19JAN2016.doc
Poll Daddy question #1
http://poll.fm/5j8ow

What are the DSP turnover rates in your organization?  (Real-time results)

- Under 20%
- 21-30%
- 31-40%
- 41-50%
- 51-60%
- over 61%
Impact of staff turnover on UMN intervention implementation studies

- **Active Support** (Larson, Ticha & Qian, 2014)
- **Self-Determination** (Abery & Ticha, 2014)
- **Comprehensive Training** (Hewitt, Nord & Bogenshutz, 2014)
- **Participatory Planning and Decision Making Group (PPDM)** (Abery, Ticha & Qian, 2015)
Poll Daddy question #2
http://poll.fm/5bk4q

Please select the top three issues you believe affect your retention rates.

- Employees are not getting along with each other
- Conflicts between employees and supervisors
- Low employee moral
- Low or inadequate wages
- Employees feel their work is not valued
- Employees feel they are inadequately trained (lack competence)
- Employees feel isolated in their jobs
The challenges & costs of recruiting

- Traditional candidate pool is shrinking
- Economy improving – more competition
- Multi-generational workforce
- Estimated cost of hiring and training new DSPs is $4,872 per position
- DSP vacancy rates result in increased stress on the remaining workforce

(ANCOR, 2009; Hewitt and Larson, 2007)
Poll Daddy question #3

http://poll.fm/5bpav

What are you doing within your organization to retain staff?

- Supporting DSP's in broader organizational initiatives
- Mentoring programs
- training/ongoing education
- Referral bonuses/incentives
- DSP recognition
- Industry networking
- Promotional/Advancement
Supporting the DSP Workforce

What’s it going to take?
Opportunities to build from

- As a network of LSS Disability programs, what’s happening?
  - Collectively
  - Individually
Workforce development LSS network

- Building Commitment
  - DSP, FLS, Leadership

- Assess the situation with baseline data
  - Turnover Calculator
  - Exit Interviews, Retention Interviews

- Identify Workforce Development Strategy
  - Align all across departments, staff, HR
  - Implementation
  - Maintenance – Check-Ins

- Periodic Data Collection
  - Is this intervention working?
Organizational culture

• Intentional learning
• Leader who knows the direct line staff by name
  • Goes out of their way to engage
  • Periodically practices direct support
  • Celebrates DSPs
• Individual story-driven
• Data-driven
  • Makes data driven decisions regarding workforce
  • Monitoring is routine
• Engages DSPs at all levels
Making a difference through implementation and scale up

• First we *implement* – *then* we scale-up
  …successful scale-up requires attention to the science and practice of implementation

• Requires change at the
  • Practice Level (Direct Support Staff)
  • Organization Level (Supervisors, Managers, Administrators)
  • System Level (Funders, Government, Regulatory Bodies)

Dean L. Fixsen and Karen A. Blase, 2008
Wages aren’t the only thing

- Of all staff who leave
  - 45% leave in first 6 months
  - 23% leave between 6-12 months
  - 15% of new hires fired in the first year
- Reasons for leaving
  - Co-workers
  - Pay or benefits
  - Supervisors
- New hires who stayed 12+ months
  - More likely to hear about the job from “inside sources”
  - Thought promotions were likely
  - More committed and more satisfied after 30 days
  - Fewer unmet expectations

Larson, Lakin, Bruininks, 1998
Poll Daddy question #4

http://poll.fm/5bq66

What recruitment and/or selection strategies do you use?

- Structured behavioral Interviewing
- RJPs (Realistic Job Previews)
- inside referrals
- Internships/volunteer opportunities
- Referral bonuses
- Target marketing
Frontline supervisors & DSP turnover

• DSP turnover is lower when
  • DSPs feel valued
  • DSPs feel they are treated fairly
• Reasons DSPs leave
  • issues with co-workers
  • issues with supervisors
Poll Daddy question #5

http://poll.fm/5j8ox

What are the FLS turnover rates in your organization?
- Under 20%
- 21-30%
- 31-40%
- 41-50%
- 51-60%
- over 61%
Participatory management

• How are you keeping people posted on what’s happening (Olmstead, Person-centered, HCBS, etc.)?
• How are you anticipating needs and concerns and reaching out proactively?
• How are you framing and defining the issues (leadership, expectations, respect, vision)?
• How are you listening to concerns and responding to them (resources, support, training, clarity, etc.)?
• What methods do you use to capture DSP perspectives and views?
Supporting frontline supervisors

• Create evidence based Frontline Supervisor Competencies that reflect best practice in current service system.
• Develop on-line workforce development tools utilizing these competencies, including:
  • candidate assessment tool
  • peer assessment
  • selection tool
  • training and development tool
  • performance evaluation
National frontline supervisor competencies

http://rtc.umn.edu/docs/NationalFrontlineSupervisorComp.pdf

1. Direct Support
2. Health, Wellness, & Safety
3. Individual Support Plan Development, Monitoring, and Assessment
4. Facilitating Community Inclusion Across the Lifespan
5. Promoting Professional Relations and Teamwork
6. Staff Recruitment, Selection, and Hiring
7. Staff Supervision, Training and Development
8. Quality Assurance
9. Advocacy & Public Relations
10. Leadership, Professionalism, & Self-Development
11. Cultural Responsiveness & Awareness
National Frontline Supervisor Competencies

Frontline Supervisor Assessment

April, 2013

National Frontline Supervisor Competencies

Frontline Supervisor Structured Interview Questions

April, 2013
Competency in direct support

- Competency standards are foundational in key processes of workforce development:
  - Recruitment, hiring, and selection
  - Curriculum development
  - Training program implementation, staff development
  - Performance evaluation
  - Career pathways, ladders and lattices:
    - Apprenticeship programs
    - Credentialing and certification systems

Campion et al., 2011
What is competency based training?

- Training that is focused on developing worker:
  - *Knowledge* (what a person knows)
  - *Skills* (what a person is able to do)
  - *Attitudes* (the way in which a DSP thinks about people with IDD, job and how they approach decision-making)

- Based on real work actions
- Goal of achieving required/desired outcomes
DSP competencies

- Community Support Skill Standards*
- IDD Residential Core*
- NADSP Competencies*
- APSE
- DOL LTSS Core Competencies*
- FLS*
- NADD
- CMS Core Competencies*

Revisions:
- CSSS 1996
- Hewitt 1998
- NADSP 2002
- APSE 2011
- DOL LTSS 2012
- FLS 2014
- NADD 2014
- CMS 2014
Methods: Study process

Baseline Survey → Sup. training → DSP Study training → Post Survey

ONE YEAR

Baseline Survey → Reg. training → Post Survey

Hewitt, Nord, Bogenshutz, 2013
Intervention: training approach

• Online training: College of Direct Support
  ▪ 35 lessons over 12 months
  ▪ 6 modules address different topics
  ▪ Pre/post-test measures
• Mentoring
  ▪ Supervisor or advanced DSP
  ▪ Mentoring on each module topic
• Group discussion
  ▪ With peers and supervisors
  ▪ Provided for each module
College of Direct Support - University of MN, Research & Training Center on Community Living
- Number of States 34
- Number of Active Learners 500,000+
- Completed Lessons (one hour) 6 million +

College of Employment Services - University of MA/Boston, Institute for Community Inclusion

College of Personal Assistance & Caregiving - University of California San Francisco, Center Community Living Policy

College of Recovery & Community Inclusion - Temple University Collaborative on Community Inclusion of Individuals with Psychiatric Disabilities
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Professionalism</th>
<th>Satisfaction with Staff</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Community Inclusion</td>
<td>Community Inclusion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Person Centered Planning</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individual Rights and Choice</td>
<td>Choices &amp; Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civil Rights and Advocacy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safety at Home and in the Community</td>
<td>Health &amp; Safety</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supporting Healthy Lives</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal Care</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>You’ve Got a Friend</td>
<td>Friends &amp; Family</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment Supports</td>
<td>Work, Day, and Home</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Home and Community Living</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal Care</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Aligning training to outcomes**

University of Minnesota
Comprehensive training study

Findings

- Intervention sites experience 16.4% decrease in turnover after one year
- DSPs showed increased competence (Rights & Choice, Health & Safety, Relationships)
- DSPs showed increased satisfaction with supervisors

Hewitt, Nord & Bogenshutz, UMN Comprehensive Training Study, 2014
Tools and Resources

Much exists to support the workforce in better supporting people with IDD to live and participate in their communities
DSP recruitment & selection strategies

- Finding and Welcoming New Employees
  - Recruitment and marketing
    - Marketing Toolkit
    - Inside recruitment sources
    - Referral Bonus
    - Internships/Volunteer
  - Selection and hiring
    - Structured interviews
    - Realistic Job Previews
Niche Group Marketing

- Gen X and Y’rs
- Faith communities
- Retirees
- Students
- Displaced workers
- Stay at home parents
Are You Called to Help Others?

Consider Working with People with Disabilities

ARROWHEAD WEST Inc.

316-722-4554
http://www.arrowheadwest.org

Ready to Do More?
Ready to Be More?

Consider Working with People with Disabilities

You have options! Make a difference in others' lives and your own. Experience a new adventure every day, starting today!

ARROWHEAD WEST Inc.

316-722-4554
http://www.arrowheadwest.org
Examples of recruitment sources

Inside sources:
- current employees
- people receiving services and their families or friends
- volunteers
- staff friends
- service coordinators or case managers
- board members

Outside sources:
- newspaper advertisements
- Internet ads
- fliers regarding open positions
- job boards and placement offices in high schools and colleges
Selecting the best candidates

The process used to assure a good match between

- The APPLICANT…with the right
  - Competencies and Skills
  - Attitudes and Values
  - Interest in and Commitment to do the job
- The ORGANIZATION…with its
  - Job Requirements and Expectations
  - Culture and Climate
  - Investment with employees
Effective selection strategies

- Structured/Behavioral interviews
- Realistic Job Previews
- Structured observations
- Cognitive ability tests
  - Writing exercises
  - English proficiency tests
- Interview with DSPs
- Interview with individuals and family members
Structured behavioral interviewing

• Each recruit answers the same set of questions
• Questions address important behaviors that distinguish excellent performers from poor performers
• Questions ask recruits to describe experiences that relate to important job behaviors
• Score the answer based on a predetermined behaviorally anchored scale of how excellent versus poor performers handle this type of situation.
Why structured interviews?

- The best predictor of future behavior is past behavior in similar circumstances that was recent or that reflected long-standing behavior patterns.
- Ask candidates to describe situations they have faced and how they handled them.
  - Situation, Behavior, Outcome
Realistic job previews

Present non-distorted information to job applicants

• about the job
• and the organization
• before a job offer has been made
Characteristics of effective RJP’s

• Present the RJP early in the application process before a job offer is made
• Make the purpose of the RJP clear to applicant
• Include viewpoints of individuals receiving supports and their family members
• Use actual observations of DSWs on the job
• Include information about how current employees view their jobs
• Balance positive and challenging parts of the job to reflect actual work requirements and experience
Why use RJP’s?

- RJP’s improve retention rates by 9% - 17%
- RJP’s increase retention of workers
  - 12% for agencies with annual retention rates of 50%, and
  - 24% for agencies with annual retention rates of 20%
My disabilities are just labels

I have Cerebral Palsy and acquired a spinal cord injury in 2005, but those are just labels.

- I use a chair, but I’m able to walk with a great deal of assistance.
- The muscles in my body are often very tight and tense.
- My speech can be difficult to understand.
- My arms and hands are pretty weak. I use my left arm to do just about everything.
RJP photo scrapbooks

- Dinner with the gals
- Reggie heading off to work
- Jo and Jean reading the paper
- Roger cleaning
- Jeff and Diane enjoying some music
DSP training + education + careers

- Competency Based Training
- Credentialing and Career Paths
Poll Daddy Question #6
http://poll.fm/5j8p3

How many hours of training (on average) do DSPs receive during DSP orientation?
- Under 20 hours
- 21-40 hours
- 41-60 hours
- 61-80 hours
- 81+ hours
NYOPWDD results: Which components need to be present in the credential structure?

- Funding
- Accessible programming: physically & academically
- "Hybrid" instructional model: onsite and online
- Provide support for learner success
- Wage and promotion incentives
- Work-based learning approaches (internships, mentoring, etc.)
National Alliance for Direct Support Professionals

Making a World of Difference in People’s Lives

- Code of Ethics (2001)
- *Frontline Initiative*
- Training and Technical Assistance
- Credentialing Program
- Annual Meeting and Conference!
NADSP credentialing

DSP-Registered (N=1009)
- Background check
- Code of ethics commitment
- Letter from employer certifying
  - All required training
  - 6 months continuous employment
  - Employee in good standing

DSP-Certified (N=101)
- One year continuous service
- 100 hours related instruction
- 4 portfolio work samples

DSP – Specialist (N=23)
Key Design Elements of the New York Direct Support Professional (DSP) Credentialing Model

1. Multi-tiered credential with a hybrid model of learning methods. The Credentials must be achieved in sequence, beginning with DSP Credential I. Proposed training opportunities include on-line training, interactive classroom learning and work-based learning opportunities —
   a. DSP Credential I includes 50 hours of training: 20 hours on-line, 10 hours classroom training, and 20 hours of work-based learning
   b. DSP Credential II includes 100 hours of training: 40 hours on-line, 20 hours classroom training, and 40 hours of work-based learning
      • Includes a specialization emphasis in one of three specializations:
         - Behavioral Support
         - Family Engagement
         - Behavioral Health

2. Valid, recognized competency-based skills and knowledge requirements. These are the identified outcomes that will be assessed across the credential program. The competencies used as the basis of the credentialing program are —
   a. New York State DSP Core Competency Goals
      • Putting people first
      • Building & maintaining positive relationships
      • Demonstrating professionalism
      • Supporting good health
      • Supporting safety
      • Having a home
Things are improving….. reflection on the past 30 years…

Positive Progress

- Occupational Title = DSP
- Credentialing options exist
- Excellent tools available
  - Growing evidence base
- Status and Image
  - Recognition
- Codified core competencies
  - DSPs + FLSs
  - Policy
- CMS letter to states/toolkit
- CMS minimal data set

Remaining Challenges

- Challenging demographic changes
- Wages are worse when adjusted for inflation
- Turnover remains challenging
- Vacancies and growth stagnation continue
- Little to no real penetration of post secondary
- Pervasive lack of IDD data
Remember policy drivers

- Litigation
- Legislation
  - Personal stories
  - Personal connections
  - Data
- Budget
- Policy initiatives
Contact information

**Amy Hewitt,**
612.625.1098
hewit005@umn.edu

**Research and Training Center on Community Living**
Institute on Community Integration (UCEDD)
University of Minnesota, Twin Cities
214 Pattee Hall, 150 Pillsbury Drive SE
Minneapolis, MN  55455

This research was supported by grant from the National Institute on Disabilities and Rehabilitation Research, U.S. Department of Education #H133G080029 and #H133B080005. Grantees undertaking projects under government sponsorship are encouraged to express freely their findings and conclusions. Points of view or opinions do not, therefore necessarily represent official NIDRR policy.